

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited
(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)

2nd Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) to evaluate Technical Proposals for "Consultancy services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2-Lane with hard shoulders of Changtongya Longleng Road on EPC basis from existing Km 0.0 to Km 16.592 [Design Km. 0+000 to Km. 18+779] (Design Length - 18.779 Km) in the state of Nagaland (Pkg-1)" under NH (O) Plan (ii) 2-Lane with hard shoulders of Changtongya - Longleng Road on EPC basis from existing Km 16.530 to Km 29.530 [Design Km. 18+779 to Km. 33+428] (Design Length - 14+649 Km) in the state of Nagaland (Pkg-2) under NH (O) Plan" held on 05.06.2020 at PTI Building, 3rd Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) vide its first meeting evaluated the technical proposals of the subject work. ETEC in its 1st meeting has asked the bidders to submit their comments by uploading Technical score and Eligibility status on website. Consequent upon Approval of Competent Authority, the technical score of the bidders along with minutes of meeting were uploaded on the website to submit the clarification/representation if any by the consultant on or before 27.05.2020.

2. In response to the above, M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrasonution Private Limited submitted their representation by due date and time.

3. In addition to the above, a Query on evaluation of technical bids were received through email from Adv. Ashok Kumar, wherein he has raised query for each consultant mainly regarding the age of key personnel considered for evaluation as per the RFP clause 12.2

4. ETEC has examined the query raised by Adv. Ashok Kumar and representation of M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrasonution Private Limited and it is observed that the age of key personnel as per RFP was 60 years, while in evaluation, it has been inadvertently considered as 65 years. Hence the committees decided to re- evaluate all the proposals as per the RFP and also in light of the query /representation received.

5. The details of query /representation received along with the decision of the committee is tabulated below:

(i) M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrasonution Private Limited

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	Marks given to Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	Consultant has represented that Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has to get 91 marks instead of 89 marks.	ETEC has examined and considered the projects mentioned at S.No. 5,6 of CV on infracon based on the undertaking submitted by Key

			personnel and accordingly increased 2 marks.
2.	Marks given to Bridge/Structural Engineer	Consultant has represented that Bridge/Structural Engineer has to get 91 marks instead of 86 marks	ETEC has examined and considered the projects mentioned at S.No 9 of CV on infracon based on his appointment letter as bridge engineer with SMEC and accordingly increased 5 marks.
3.	Marks given to Road Safety Expert	Consultant has represented that Bridge/Structural Engineer has to get 95 marks instead of 89 marks	ETEC has examined and considered post graduate in Highway equivalent to traffic and the projects mentioned at S.No. 14,32,33 of CV on infracon and accordingly increased 6 marks.
4.	Marks given to Senior Quality/Material Expert	It is stated to review the mark of Mr. Nune Kiran, Senior Quality/Material Expert	ETEC has examined and found that there is no change in marks.

(ii) For M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	Marks given to Road Safety Expert	It is stated that the age of Mr. Pradeep Agrawal, Road Safety Expert is more than 60 years.	ETEC has examined and the age of Pradeep Agrawal was more than 60 years hence the same was not considered and assigned zero marks.

(iii) M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	Marks given to Bridge/Structural Engineer	It is stated that the age of Mr. Bahadur Birendra Kumar, Bridge/Structural Engineer is more than 60 years.	ETEC has examined and the age of Mr. Bahadur Birendra Kumar was more than 60 years hence the same was not

[Handwritten signatures and initials]

			considered and assigned zero marks
--	--	--	------------------------------------

(iv) M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd jv with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	For M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd jv with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd Marks given to Senior Quality/Material Expert	It is stated that Mr. Surya Bhushan Singh, Senior Quality/Material Expert has done MTech in Transportation Engineering while MTech in Geotechnical Engineering/ Foundation Engineering / Soil Mechanics / Rock Mechanics is required for the post of Senior Quality/Material Expert.	ETEC has examined and MTech in Transportation Engineering is not considered, hence 4 marks were reduced.

(v) M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	Marks given to Road Safety Expert	It is stated to review the mark of Mr. Saroj Kumar, Road Safety Expert	ETEC has examined and found that there is no change in marks.
2.	Marks given to Team leader cum Highway expert	It is observed that the age of Team leader was more than 60 years hence the same was not considered and assigned zero marks.	ETEC has decided that since the team leader has zero marks i.e. less than 70 marks, hence as per clause 3.4 X(e), the bid should not be considered for further evaluation and termed as non responsive.

(vi) M/s Jindals Consortium

S.No.	Description	Representation/ observation of committee	Decision of ETEC
1.	Marks given to Bridge/Structural Engineer	It is observed that the age of Bridge/Structural Engineer was more than	ETEC has examined and the age of Bridge/Structural

		60 years hence the same was not considered and assigned zero marks.	Engineer was more than 60 years hence the same was not considered and assigned zero marks..
--	--	---	---





6. Considering Para 5 above, the revised evaluation is tabulated as under:

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment (40 marks)	Experience in use of technology for road inspection (20 marks)	Qualification and competence of the key staff for the assignment (40 marks)	Total (100 marks)	Remarks
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	40.00	18.00	32.16	90.16	Qualified
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	38.75	15.00	25.36	79.11	Not Qualified (Team Leader's mark is zero, hence as per clause 3.4 X(e), the bid should not be considered for further evaluation and termed as non responsive.
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	19.00	36.72	95.72	Qualified
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	20.00	31.18	91.18	Qualified

5	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	38.50	14.00	30.30	82.80	Qualified
6	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrsolution Private Limited	40.00	18.00	36.80	94.80	Qualified

7. In view of the above, committee recommends that Financial bids of the following technically qualified firms with their respective technical score to be opened after 5 days with the approval of Competent Authority.

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Score	Remarks
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	90.16	Qualified
2	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	95.72	Qualified
3	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	91.18	Qualified
4	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	82.80	Qualified

5	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrsolution Private Limited	94.80	Qualified
---	--	-------	-----------

The Finance has evaluated tender and concerned marks allotted to the bidders and there is no change in that.
Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the chair.



A. K. Jha
DGM (Tech.)
(Member Secretary)



Y.C. Srivastava
GM (Tech.)
(Member)




Mahesh Gupta
Dy. GM (Fin.)
(Member)



Ajay Ahluwalia
Executive Director-I
Chairman

Technical Evaluation						Remarks
Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment (40 marks)	Experience in use of technology for road inspection (20 marks)	Qualification and competence of the key staff for the assignment (40 marks)	Total (100 marks)	
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	40.00	18.00	32.16	90.16	Qualified (Road Safety Expert Fail due to age is greater than 60 years)
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	38.75	15.00	25.36	79.11	Not Qualified (Team Leader Fail due to age is greater than 60 years)
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	19.00	36.72	95.72	Qualified
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	20.00	31.18	91.18	Qualified (Bridge Engineer Fail due to age is greater than 60 years)
5	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	38.50	14.00	30.30	82.80	Qualified (Bridge Engineer Fail due to age is greater than 60 years)
6	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrapolution Private Limited	40.00	18.00	36.80	94.80	Qualified


 A. K. Jha
 Dy. General Manager(Tech)
 Member Secretary


 Ajay Ahluwalia
 ED-1
 Convener


 Y. C. Srivastava
 General Manager(T)
 Member


 Mahesh Gupta
 Dy. General Manager(Fin)
 Member

Relevant Experience of the firm for the assignment

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Relevant Experience of the firm for the assignment						Total (40 marks)
		Max. Marks - 2 Average Annual Turnover (last 3 years) from consultancy business < Rs. 7,572 Cr. - 0 marks Rs. 7,572 Cr. - 1.5 marks Add for additional turnover 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks for every Rs. 3,786 Cr. above Rs. 7,572 Cr. subject to maximum 0.5 marks TPC= Rs.378,60 Cr. Rs. 7,572 Cr. - 1.5 marks Rs. 11,358 Cr. - 1.75 marks Rs. 15,144 Cr. - 2 marks	Max. marks = 10 for Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm <10 - 0 mark 10-20 - 8 marks >20 but ≤30 - 9 marks >30 - 10 marks	Max. marks = 10 for Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 214/6-laning* of length equal to 28.4 km or more in last 7 years. 1 project - 8 marks Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Authority Engineer/Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (Two) marks.	Max. marks = 5 for Design Report Preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 214/6-laning* of length (equal to 28.4 km or more in last 7 years. Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary 1 project - 4 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 mark.	Max. marks = 10 for in hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/ Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) <2 - 0 mark 2-5 - 5 marks >5 - 10 marks	Max. marks = 3 for Experience in Construction Supervision/DPR/Design Review of Major structures having length of more than 500 meter in last 7 years. 1 project - 2.0 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1.0 marks	
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt.Ltd	2 43.95 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 27 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)	10 (34 key personnel details are at page no. 206 to 211 of Submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 34 to 91 of submitted Technical Bid)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 92 to 157 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 158 to 205 of submitted Technical Bid)	3 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 92 to 157 of submitted Technical Bid)	40.000
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructure Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	1.75 14.62 Cr. (CA certificate (M.No.) is at page no 29 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant (DD))	10 (31 key personnel details are at page no. 145 to 148 of Submitted Technical Bid)	10 4 projects (Sr. No. 1,2,4,5 in Non PPP project) (details are at page no 60 to 87 of submitted Technical Bid)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 88 to 105 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 106 to 144 of submitted Technical Bid)	2 only 1 project (above 500 m) (details are at page no 104 to 105 of submitted Technical Bid)	38.750
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Astechno Consultants (India) P.Vt. Ltd.	2 31.296 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 78 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)	10 (31 key personnel details are at page no. 366 to 374 of Submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 99 to 152 of submitted Technical Bid)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 153 to 200 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 243 to 263 of submitted Technical Bid)	3 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 201 to 242 of submitted Technical Bid)	40.000
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	2 16.96 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 73 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)	10 (39 Key Personnel (Lead - 19 & JV - 20 key personnel) details are at page no 372 & 392 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 5 projects (Lead - Sr. No. 1,2,3 & 9 and JV - Sr. No. 3) (details are at page no 225 to 258 of submitted Technical Bid)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 259 to 287 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 310 to 350 of submitted Technical Bid)	3 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 351 to 371 of submitted Technical Bid)	38.5
5	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	1.5 7.909 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 21 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)	10 (36 key personnel details are at page no. 55 to 551 of Submitted Technical Bid)	9 2 projects (details are at page no 73 to 105 of submitted Technical Bid) (only Project no 2 & 4)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 106 to 150 of submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 151 to 195 of submitted Technical Bid)	3 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 120 to 124 of submitted Technical Bid)	40
6	M/s Technocrat Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadish Infraconsult Private Limited	2 28.84 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 84 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant) (UDIN no not available)	10 (44 key personnel details are at page no. 396 to 400 of Submitted Technical Bid)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 120 to 239 of submitted Technical Bid) (Sr. No. 1,2,3,4 & 8)	5 more than 3 projects (details are at page no 135 to 143 of submitted Technical Bid) (Sr. No. 12,13,14,15)	10 more than 5 projects (details are at page no 144 to 148 of submitted Technical Bid)	3 3 projects (details are at page no 120 & 149 to 151 of submitted Technical Bid)	40

A. K. Jha
Dy. General Manager(Tech)
Member Secretary

ED-1
Convenor

V. C. Srivastava
General Manager(T)
Member

Mukul Sharma
Dy. General Manager(Fin)
Member

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer (12 marks)	Resident cum Highway Engineer (6 marks)	Bridge/ Structure Engineer (6 marks)	Senior Quality cum Material Expert (6 marks)	Senior Pavement Specialist (6 marks)	Road Safety Expert (4 marks)	Total (40 marks)
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	10.32	5.46	5.46	5.46	5.46	0.00	32.16
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	0.00	5.22	5.46	5.46	5.46	3.76	25.36
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arktichno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	10.92	5.70	5.46	5.46	5.46	3.72	36.72
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	10.92	5.70	0.00	5.46	5.46	3.64	31.18
5	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	10.44	5.46	0.00	5.46	5.46	3.48	30.30
6	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrasonlution Private Limited	10.92	5.46	5.46	5.70	5.46	3.80	36.80


 A. K. Jha
 Dy. General Manager(Tech)
 Member Secretary


 Y. C. Srivastava
 General Manager(T)
 Member



 Ajay Ahluwalia
 FD-1
 Convener


 Mahesh Gupta
 Dy.General Manager(Fin)
 Member

Project Name: Consultancy services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of (i) 2-Lane with hard shoulders of Changtongya Longleng Road on EPC basis from existing Km 0.0 to Km 16.592 [Design Km. 0+000 to Km. 18+779] (Design Length – 18.779 Km) in the state of Nagaland (Pkg-1) under NH (O) Plan (ii) 2-Lane with hard shoulders of Changtongya – Longleng Road on EPC basis from existing Km 16.530 to Km 29.530 [Design Km. 18+779 to Km. 33+428] (Design Length –14+649 Km) in the state of Nagaland (Pkg-2) under NH (O) Plan.

Stage I- Proof of Eligibility

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6** laneing/Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 2 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited i.e. 66.856 km	The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision/Independent Engineer/ Consultant of 2/4/6** laneing/Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 3 times or more of similar category** for which RFP is invited i.e. 100.284 km	Firm should also have experience of Project Supervision/ Independent Engineer/ Authority' Engineer of at least one project of similar category of two/four/six** laneing/bridge work of length equal to 40% of project length i.e. 13.3712 km	Annual average turnover: Annual turnover (updated average of last 3 years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than 2% of Estimated Project Cost i.e. 7.572 cr.
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	117.62 km (Sr. No. 1) (Project details are at page no 92 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	188 km (Project details are at page no 34 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant) (Sr. no. 1,4 & 5)	1 no of project (47 km) (Project details are at page no 34 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	43.95 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 27 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	121 km (Project details are at page no 92 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	Above 100.5 km (Project details are at page no 61 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	1 no of project (23.68 km) (Project details are at page no 61 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	14.62 Cr. (CA certificate (M.No.) is at page no 29 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant (DD)).
3	M/s Chaityanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	241 km (Project details are at page no 153 to 200 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	157 km (Project details are at page no 99 to 101 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	1 no of Project (86 km) (Project details are at page no 99 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	31.296 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 78 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	111.4 km (Project details are at page no 259 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	Above 100.5 km (Project details are at page no 225 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	1 no of project (Project details are at page no 225 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	16.96 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 73 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)
5	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	Above 100 km (Project details are at page no 106 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	Above 100.5 km (Project details are at page no 73 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	1 no of project (Project details are at page no 73 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	7.909 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 21 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant)
6	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infrasolution Private Limited	Above 350 km (Project details are at page no 139 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant) (Sr. No. 12)	Above 100.5 km (Project details are at page no 120 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	1 no of project (42 km) (Project details are at page no 120 of Technical bid submitted by Consultant)	28.84 Cr. (CA certificate is at page no 84 of Technical Bid submitted by consultant) (UDIN/no not available)


A.K./Jha
Dy. General Manager(Tech)
Member Secretary


Ajay Ahluwalia
ED-1
Convener


Y. C. Srivastava
General Manager(TT)
Member


Manish Gupta
Dy.General Manager(Fin)
Member

Criteria for Experience in use of technology for road inspection

Sr. No.	Description	Maximum Points	1	1.1	1.1.1	1.1.2	2	2.1	2.1.1	2.1.2	2.2	3	3.1	3.2	4	4.1	4.2	Total
			Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	Equipment	5	2	4	4	4	4	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	20
		Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	18
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed
	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Meinhardt Singapore Pte. Ltd.	Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	15
		Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	15
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed
	M/s Chatanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd JV with M/s Arkitechno Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.	Points obtained	6	4	4	2	4	4	4	4	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	19
		Points obtained	6	4	4	2	4	4	4	4	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	19
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed
	M/s Marc Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	Points obtained	7	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	20
		Points obtained	7	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	2	5	2	2	4	2	2	20
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed
	M/s Jindals Consortium in association with M/s VYOM GANGA ENGINEERS & CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	14
		Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	14
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed
	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Jagadambike Infra solution Private Limited	Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	18
		Points obtained	5	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	4	1	1	3	2	2	18
		Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed	Reference/ Details of projects Claimed

A. K. Jha
Dy. General Manager(Tech)
Member Secretary

Y. C. Srinivastava
General Manager(T)
Member

Ajay Ahluwalia
ED-1
Convenor

Maresh Gupta
Dy.General Manager(Fin)
Member